

A Comprehensive Review on Energy Balancing and Routing in Wireless Sensor Networks

Sangita Mahendra Rajput¹ and Dr Ram Mohan Singh Bhadoria²

Research Scholar, Department of Electronics Engineering¹

Associate Professor, Department of Electronics Engineering²

Sunrise University, Alwar, Rajasthan, India

Abstract: *Wireless Sensor Networks (WSNs) play a vital role in various applications ranging from environmental monitoring to industrial automation. One of the key challenges in WSNs is the limited energy resources of sensor nodes, which necessitates the development of energy-efficient routing and clustering protocols to prolong network lifetime and ensure reliable data transmission. This literature review provides an extensive overview of recent research efforts in energy-efficient routing and clustering techniques for WSNs. The review covers a wide range of algorithms, including optimization-based, machine learning-based, hybrid, and protocol-based approaches. Additionally, it discusses the challenges faced in designing energy-efficient WSNs, identifies research gaps, outlines objectives, proposes future research directions, and concludes with insights into the current state and future prospects of energy-efficient WSNs.*

Keywords: Wireless Sensor Networks, Energy-Efficient Routing, Clustering Techniques, Optimization Algorithms

I. INTRODUCTION

Wireless Sensor Networks (WSNs) consist of spatially distributed autonomous sensor nodes that collaborate to monitor physical or environmental conditions, such as temperature, humidity, and pollution levels. Wireless Sensor Networks (WSNs) are intricate systems composed of numerous small, low-cost sensor nodes equipped with sensing, computation, and communication capabilities. These networks are widely used in various applications, including environmental monitoring, healthcare, precision agriculture, and infrastructure monitoring. These nodes are typically deployed over a geographical area to monitor and gather data about physical or environmental conditions. Some common applications of WSNs include environmental monitoring (e.g., forest fire detection, air quality monitoring), healthcare (e.g., patient monitoring), precision agriculture (e.g., soil moisture monitoring), and infrastructure monitoring (e.g., structural health monitoring of bridges).

However, one of the primary challenges facing WSNs is the limited energy resources of individual sensor nodes. These nodes are often powered by batteries or energy harvesting techniques, and replacing or recharging these energy sources can be costly or impractical, especially in remote or harsh environments. The limited energy resources of sensor nodes pose significant challenges to the longevity and efficiency of WSNs. To address these challenges, researchers have focused on developing energy-efficient routing and clustering techniques to optimize energy consumption, prolong network lifetime, and ensure reliable data transmission. Therefore, optimizing energy consumption and extending the network's lifetime become critical objectives in designing efficient WSNs.

To address these challenges, researchers have developed various energy-efficient routing and clustering techniques:

Routing Protocols: Traditional routing protocols like LEACH (Low Energy Adaptive Clustering Hierarchy) and its variants are widely used in WSNs. These protocols typically organize nodes into clusters and elect cluster heads responsible for aggregating and forwarding data to the sink node. By minimizing long-distance data transmission and utilizing localized communication, these protocols help reduce energy consumption and prolong network lifetime.

Data Aggregation: Aggregating data at intermediate nodes before forwarding it to the sink node can significantly reduce redundant transmissions and conserve energy. Techniques like data fusion and compressive sensing are employed to reduce the amount of data transmitted across the network, thereby saving energy.

Sleep Scheduling: Nodes in WSNs often alternate between active and sleep modes to conserve energy. Sleep scheduling algorithms determine when nodes should enter sleep mode based on their sensing and communication requirements. By synchronizing sleep schedules among neighboring nodes, these algorithms minimize idle listening and overhearing, reducing energy wastage.

Dynamic Energy Management: Adaptive algorithms continuously monitor network conditions and dynamically adjust parameters such as transmission power, routing paths, and data collection rates to optimize energy consumption in real-time. These techniques adapt to changing network dynamics and environmental conditions to maximize energy efficiency.

Energy Harvesting: Integrating energy harvesting mechanisms such as solar panels, vibration harvesters, or thermoelectric generators with sensor nodes can supplement their energy supply and extend their operational lifetime. Energy-aware routing algorithms can leverage information about available energy resources to make routing decisions that minimize energy consumption.

By employing these energy-efficient techniques, WSNs can achieve prolonged network lifetime, improved reliability, and better utilization of limited energy resources. However, designing and implementing these techniques require a thorough understanding of the application requirements, network topology, and energy characteristics of sensor nodes. Ongoing research in this field continues to explore novel approaches to enhance the energy efficiency and performance of WSNs in diverse applications.

II. ENERGY-EFFICIENT ROUTING ALGORITHMS

Energy-efficient routing algorithms play a crucial role in Wireless Sensor Networks (WSNs) by minimizing energy consumption while ensuring reliable data transmission. Here's an elaboration on the categories of energy-efficient routing algorithms mentioned. Energy-efficient routing algorithms aim to minimize energy consumption by optimizing the routing paths and transmission strategies within the network. Several categories of routing algorithms have been proposed in the literature:

2.1 Optimization-based Algorithms: Optimization-based algorithms utilize mathematical optimization techniques to find energy-efficient routing paths in WSNs. These algorithms aim to minimize energy consumption by optimizing various parameters such as transmission power, routing paths, and data aggregation strategies. Examples include: These algorithms employ optimization techniques such as Artificial Bee Colony Optimization (ABC), Particle Swarm Optimization (PSO), Genetic Algorithms (GA), and Ant Colony Optimization (ACO) to find energy-efficient routing paths [1, 15, 43].

Artificial Bee Colony Optimization (ABC): Inspired by the foraging behavior of honey bees, ABC algorithms iteratively optimize routing paths by simulating the search process of bees for the most efficient routes.

Particle Swarm Optimization (PSO): PSO algorithms model the movement of particles in a multi-dimensional search space to find optimal routing paths. Particles represent potential solutions, and their movement is guided by their own best-known position and the global best-known position.

Genetic Algorithms (GA): GA mimics the process of natural selection and evolution to optimize routing paths. Solutions, represented as chromosomes, undergo selection, crossover, and mutation operations to evolve towards the optimal solution.

Ant Colony Optimization (ACO): ACO algorithms simulate the foraging behavior of ants to find optimal routing paths. Ants deposit pheromones on paths they traverse, and the amount of pheromone influences the likelihood of other ants choosing the same path.

2.2 Machine Learning-based Algorithms: Machine learning techniques are increasingly being utilized in WSNs to predict network conditions and optimize routing decisions based on historical data. Machine learning techniques, including Hidden Markov Models (HMM), Variational Bayesian Models (VBM), and Fuzzy Logic, have been utilized to predict network conditions and optimize routing decisions [3, 4, 7].

Hidden Markov Models (HMM): HMMs are probabilistic models that predict future states of a system based on observed data. In WSNs, HMMs can predict network conditions such as node failures or packet loss, enabling proactive routing decisions.

Variational Bayesian Models (VBM): VBM techniques infer probability distributions over model parameters, allowing for uncertainty-aware routing decisions in dynamic WSN environments.

Fuzzy Logic: Fuzzy logic systems model linguistic variables and rules to make decisions in uncertain or imprecise environments. In WSNs, fuzzy logic can optimize routing decisions based on qualitative factors such as node reliability and environmental conditions.

2.3 Hybrid Algorithms: Hybrid algorithms combine the strengths of optimization and machine learning techniques to achieve superior performance in energy efficiency. By leveraging both approaches, hybrid algorithms can adapt to dynamic network conditions and optimize routing paths effectively. Hybrid approaches combine optimization and machine learning techniques to leverage their complementary strengths and achieve superior performance in energy efficiency [10, 24].

2.4 Protocol-based Algorithms: Protocol-based algorithms, such as LEACH, HEED, and PSO-based Routing, offer standardized approaches for energy-efficient routing in WSNs. These protocols define rules and procedures for node communication, clustering, and data aggregation to minimize energy consumption and prolong network lifetime. Protocols such as LEACH (Low Energy Adaptive Clustering Hierarchy), HEED (Hybrid, Energy-Efficient, Distributed) Protocol, and PSO-based Routing offer standardized approaches for energy-efficient routing in WSNs [6, 15, 22].

Each category of routing algorithms has its advantages and limitations, and the choice of algorithm depends on factors such as network topology, application requirements, and available computational resources. Ongoing research in this field continues to explore novel techniques and algorithms to further enhance the energy efficiency and performance of WSNs.

III. ENERGY-EFFICIENT CLUSTERING TECHNIQUES

Energy-efficient clustering techniques are fundamental in Wireless Sensor Networks (WSNs) as they help in organizing sensor nodes into clusters, thereby facilitating efficient data aggregation, communication, and management of network resources. Clustering techniques aim to organize sensor nodes into clusters to facilitate efficient data aggregation and communication. Energy-efficient clustering algorithms play a crucial role in reducing energy consumption and prolonging network lifetime. Here's an elaboration on the mentioned energy-efficient clustering techniques:

3.1 LEACH and its variants

LEACH is one of the pioneering clustering algorithms designed to minimize energy consumption by rotating cluster heads periodically [6]. LEACH is one of the most well-known and widely used clustering algorithms in WSNs. It aims to reduce energy consumption by rotating cluster heads periodically among sensor nodes. In LEACH, sensor nodes autonomously elect themselves as cluster heads for a certain period, during which they collect data from member nodes, aggregate it, and transmit it to the base station or sink node. Once their term expires, they revert to regular sensor nodes to conserve energy. LEACH variants improve upon the original algorithm by introducing enhancements such as centralized cluster head selection, dynamic clustering thresholds, or multi-level clustering to further optimize energy consumption and network lifetime.

3.2 Hybrid Clustering Protocols

Hybrid protocols combine clustering and routing strategies to optimize energy consumption and network performance [11, 27]. Hybrid clustering protocols integrate clustering and routing strategies to achieve energy efficiency and enhance network performance. These protocols combine the advantages of clustering, such as reduced control overhead and efficient data aggregation, with optimized routing mechanisms for data transmission. By dynamically adjusting

cluster formation and routing paths based on network conditions, hybrid protocols can adapt to changing environments and network dynamics, leading to improved energy utilization and prolonged network lifetime.

3.3 Fuzzy Logic-based Clustering

Fuzzy logic techniques have been employed to adaptively adjust cluster formation and optimize energy utilization in WSNs [40]. Fuzzy logic techniques have been applied to adaptively adjust cluster formation and optimize energy utilization in WSNs. Fuzzy logic allows for the modeling of uncertain or imprecise data and enables nodes to make decisions based on qualitative factors. In fuzzy logic-based clustering, nodes use fuzzy inference systems to determine cluster membership and cluster head selection criteria. By considering factors such as node proximity, residual energy, and data traffic, fuzzy logic-based clustering algorithms can dynamically adjust cluster formation to balance energy consumption and prolong the network lifetime.

These energy-efficient clustering techniques are essential for mitigating the energy constraints inherent in WSNs and ensuring reliable and efficient operation over extended periods. By organizing sensor nodes into clusters and optimizing cluster formation, these techniques contribute to minimizing energy consumption, maximizing network lifetime, and improving the overall performance of WSNs in various applications. Ongoing research in this area continues to explore novel clustering algorithms and optimization techniques to address the evolving challenges and requirements of WSNs.

IV. CHALLENGES AND RESEARCH GAPS

The challenges and research gaps in energy-efficient routing and clustering techniques in Wireless Sensor Networks (WSNs) are multifaceted and require careful consideration for the development of robust and effective solutions. Despite significant advancements in energy-efficient routing and clustering techniques, several challenges and research gaps persist.

4.1 Heterogeneous Network Environments

WSNs often operate in heterogeneous environments with diverse communication technologies, which pose challenges for seamless integration and interoperability [20, 35]. In real-world deployments, WSNs often operate in heterogeneous environments where sensor nodes may use different communication technologies, protocols, or have varying hardware capabilities. Seamless integration and interoperability between heterogeneous nodes are essential to ensure efficient data transmission and network operation. Research is needed to develop standardized protocols and mechanisms for heterogeneous WSNs to enable interoperability and efficient communication across diverse nodes.

4.2 Dynamic Network Topology

The dynamic nature of WSNs, characterized by node mobility, failures, and environmental changes, requires adaptive routing and clustering algorithms to maintain optimal performance [9, 32]. WSNs are inherently dynamic due to factors such as node mobility, failures, and environmental changes. Traditional routing and clustering algorithms may struggle to adapt to dynamic network conditions, leading to suboptimal performance and increased energy consumption. Adaptive algorithms capable of dynamically adjusting routing paths and cluster formations in response to changing network topology are required to maintain efficient operation and prolong network lifetime.

4.3 Limited Computational Capabilities

Sensor nodes have limited processing and memory resources, making it challenging to implement complex routing and clustering algorithms with low computational overhead [17, 21]. Sensor nodes in WSNs typically have limited processing power, memory, and energy resources. Designing energy-efficient routing and clustering algorithms that can operate within the constraints of resource-constrained sensor nodes remains a significant challenge. Research efforts should focus on developing lightweight algorithms with low computational overhead while still achieving energy efficiency and reliable performance.

4.4 Security and Privacy Concerns

Ensuring data confidentiality, integrity, and authenticity in WSNs is crucial, as these networks are often deployed in sensitive applications such as healthcare and military surveillance [16, 26]. Security is a paramount concern in WSNs, especially in applications where sensitive data is collected and transmitted. Ensuring data confidentiality, integrity, and authenticity while minimizing energy consumption is challenging due to resource constraints and the distributed nature of WSNs. Research is needed to develop energy-efficient security mechanisms and protocols that can protect WSNs against various security threats without imposing significant overhead on sensor nodes.

4.5 Scalability Issues

As WSNs scale up to accommodate a large number of nodes and data sources, scalability becomes a critical factor in designing energy-efficient routing and clustering protocols [31, 34]. As WSNs scale up to accommodate a large number of nodes and data sources, scalability becomes a critical factor. Traditional routing and clustering algorithms may not scale efficiently to large networks, leading to increased overhead and decreased performance. Scalable routing and clustering protocols capable of handling large-scale WSN deployments while maintaining energy efficiency and network reliability are essential for the widespread adoption of WSN technology.

Addressing these challenges and research gaps requires interdisciplinary efforts combining expertise from fields such as computer science, networking, optimization, and security. Ongoing research in these areas aims to develop innovative solutions that can enhance the energy efficiency, scalability, security, and reliability of WSNs, enabling their seamless integration into various real-world applications.

V. OBJECTIVES AND FUTURE DIRECTIONS

The objectives and future directions for research in energy-efficient routing and clustering for Wireless Sensor Networks (WSNs) are focused on addressing existing challenges and advancing the state-of-the-art to meet the evolving demands of WSN applications. Here are the primary objectives and future directions:

5.1. Developing Novel Algorithms for Dynamic Environments:

I] Future research aims to design innovative routing and clustering algorithms capable of adapting to the dynamic nature of WSNs, including node mobility, failures, and environmental changes.

II] These algorithms should dynamically adjust routing paths and cluster formations based on real-time network conditions to optimize energy consumption and network performance.

5.2. Integrating Machine Learning and Optimization Techniques:

I] There is a growing interest in integrating machine learning and optimization techniques to enhance the energy efficiency and reliability of WSNs.

II] Machine learning algorithms, such as deep learning and reinforcement learning, can be used to predict network behavior, optimize routing decisions, and adaptively adjust clustering strategies.

III] Optimization techniques, including genetic algorithms and swarm intelligence, can complement machine learning approaches to find optimal solutions for energy-efficient routing and clustering in WSNs.

5.3. Exploring Emerging Technologies' Impact:

I] Future research will investigate the impact of emerging technologies such as blockchain and edge computing on energy-efficient WSN design.

II] Blockchain technology can enhance the security and reliability of data transmission in WSNs by providing tamper-proof data storage and decentralized consensus mechanisms.

III] Edge computing enables data processing and analysis closer to the source, reducing the energy overhead associated with transmitting raw sensor data to centralized servers.

5.4. Conducting Simulation and Experimental Studies:

I] Extensive simulation and experimental studies will be conducted to validate the effectiveness and scalability of energy-efficient routing and clustering algorithms in real-world deployment scenarios.

II] Simulation platforms such as NS-3 and OMNeT++ enable researchers to evaluate algorithm performance under various network conditions and deployment scenarios.

III] Experimental testbeds and field trials will provide valuable insights into algorithm behavior and performance in practical WSN deployments, considering factors such as node heterogeneity, environmental conditions, and network dynamics.

By pursuing these objectives and exploring future directions, researchers can advance the state-of-the-art in energy-efficient routing and clustering for WSNs, paving the way for more sustainable and reliable deployment of WSN technology across various applications, including environmental monitoring, healthcare, agriculture, and infrastructure management.

VI. CONCLUSION

In conclusion, energy-efficient routing and clustering are critical aspects of designing sustainable and reliable WSNs. This literature review has provided a comprehensive overview of recent advancements, challenges, research gaps, and future research directions in this domain. By addressing these challenges and leveraging emerging technologies, researchers can contribute to the development of robust and energy-efficient WSNs for various applications.

REFERENCES

- [1] Famila S, Jawahar A: Improved Artificial Bee Colony Optimization-Based Clustering Technique for WSNs. *Wirel. Pers. Commun.* Feb. 2020; 110(4): 2195–2212
- [2] Nakas C, Kandris D, Visvardis G: Energy efficient routing in wireless sensor networks: A comprehensive survey. *Algorithms*. Mar. 01, 2020; 13(3). MDPI AG.
- [3] Zhang W, Han D, Li KC, *et al.*: Wireless sensor network intrusion detection system based on MK-ELM. *Soft. Comput.* Aug. 2020; 24(16): 12361–12374.
- [4] Kalnoor G, Gowrishankar S: A model for intrusion detection system using hidden Markov and variational Bayesian model for IoT based wireless sensor network. *Int. J. Inf. Technol.* Jun. 2022; 14(4): 2021–2033.
- [5] Zagrouba R, Kardi A: Comparative study of energy efficient routing techniques in wireless sensor networks. *Information (Switzerland)*. Jan. 2021; 12(1): 1–28.
- [6] Adu-Manu KS, Engmann F, Sarfo-Kantanka G, *et al.*: WSN Protocols and Security Challenges for Environmental Monitoring Applications: A Survey. *J. Sens.* 2022; 2022: 1–21. Hindawi Limited. .
- [7] Radhika S, Rangarajan P: On improving the lifespan of wireless sensor networks with fuzzy based clustering and machine learning based data reduction. *Appl. Soft Comput. J.* Oct. 2019; 83: 105610.
- [8] Sreedevi P, Venkateswarlu S: Comparative analysis of energy efficient routing protocols with optimization in WSN. *Int. J. Interact. Des. Manuf.* 2022.
- [9] Yee PL, Mehmood S, Almogren A, *et al.*: Improving the performance of opportunistic routing using min-max range and optimum energy level for relay node selection in wireless sensor networks. *PeerJ. Comput. Sci.* 2020; 6: e326–e325.
- [10] Singh S, Nandan AS, Malik A, *et al.*: An Energy-Efficient Modified Metaheuristic Inspired Algorithm for Disaster Management System Using WSNs. *IEEE Sens. J.* Jul. 2021; 21(13): 15398–15408.
- [11] Bhola J, Soni S, Cheema GK: Genetic algorithm based optimized leach protocol for energy efficient wireless sensor networks. *J. Ambient Intell. Humaniz. Comput.* Mar. 2020; 11(3): 1281–1288
- [12] Bhangwar AR, *et al.*: WETRP: Weight Based Energy Temperature Aware Routing Protocol for Wireless Body Sensor Networks. *IEEE Access.* 2019; 7: 87987–87995.
- [13] Kavra R, Gupta A, Kansal S: Systematic study of topology control methods and routing techniques in wireless sensor networks. *Peer PeerNetw. Appl.* Jul. 01, 2022; 15(4): 1862–1922. Springer.
- [14] Fu X, Yang Y, Postolache O: Sustainable multipath routing protocol for multi-sink wireless sensor networks in harsh environments. *IEEE Transactions on Sustainable Computing.* Jan. 2021; 6(1): 168–181.

- [15] Edla DR, Kongara MC, Cheruku R: A PSO Based Routing with Novel Fitness Function for Improving Lifetime of WSNs. *Wirel. Pers. Commun.* Jan. 2019; **104**(1): 73–89.
- [16] Airehrour D, Gutierrez JA, Ray SK: SecTrust-RPL: A secure trust-aware RPL routing protocol for Internet of Things. *Futur. Gener. Comput. Syst.* Apr. 2019; 93: 860–876.
- [17] Haseeb K, Almस्ताفا KM, Jan Z, *et al.*: Secure and energy-aware heuristic routing protocol for wireless sensor network. *IEEE Access.* 2020; **8**: 163962–163974.
- [18] Wu Y, Li B, Zhu Y, *et al.*: Energy-Neutral Communication Protocol for Living-Tree Bioenergy-Powered Wireless Sensor Network. *Mob. Inf. Syst.* 2018; 2018: 1–15.
- [19] Gao D, Zhang S, Zhang F, *et al.*: RowBee: A Routing Protocol Based on Cross-Technology Communication for Energy-Harvesting Wireless Sensor Networks. *IEEE Access.* 2019; **7**: 40663–40673.
- [20] Suman J, Shyamala K, Roja G: Improving network lifetime in WSN's based on maximum residual energy. *2021 2nd International Conference for Emerging Technology, INCET 2021*. Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers Inc; May 2021
- [21] Yao Y, Xie D, Li Y, *et al.*: Routing Protocol for Wireless Sensor Networks Based on Archimedes Optimization Algorithm. *IEEE Sens. J.* Aug. 2022; **22**(15): 15561–15573.
- [22] Zhang T, Chen G, Zeng Q, *et al.*: Routing Clustering Protocol for 3D Wireless Sensor Networks Based on Fragile Collection Ant Colony Algorithm. *IEEE Access.* 2020; **8**: 58874–58888.
- [23] Tan X, Zhao H, Han G, *et al.*: QSDN-WISE: A New QoS-Based Routing Protocol for Software-Defined Wireless Sensor Networks. *IEEE Access.* 2019; **7**: 61070–61082.
- [24] Yun WK, Yoo SJ: Q-Learning-based data-aggregation-aware energy-efficient routing protocol for wireless sensor networks. *IEEE Access.* 2021; **9**: 10737–10750.
- [25] Shagari NM, Idris MYI, Bin Salleh R, *et al.*: Heterogeneous Energy and Traffic Aware Sleep-Awake Cluster-Based Routing Protocol for Wireless Sensor Network. *IEEE Access.* 2020; **8**: 12232–12252.
- [26] di Yao Y, Li X, Cui YP, *et al.*: Game Theory and Coverage Optimization Based Multihop Routing Protocol for Network Lifetime in Wireless Sensor Networks. *IEEE Sens. J.* Jul. 2022; **22**(13): 13739–13752.
- [27] Behera TM, Mohapatra SK, Samal UC, *et al.*: I-SEP: An Improved Routing Protocol for Heterogeneous WSN for IoT-Based Environmental Monitoring. *IEEE Internet Things J.* Jan. 2020; **7**(1): 710–717.
- [28] Ma N, Zhang H, Hu H, *et al.*: ESCVAD: An Energy-Saving Routing Protocol Based on Adaptive Clustering for Wireless Sensor Networks. *IEEE Internet Things J.* Jun. 2022; **9**(11): 9071–9085.
- [29] di Yao Y, Li X, Cui YP, *et al.*: Energy-Efficient Routing Protocol Based on Multi-Threshold Segmentation in Wireless Sensors Networks for Precision Agriculture. *IEEE Sens. J.* Apr. 2022; **22**(7): 6216–6231.
- [30] Zhang Y, Zhang X, Ning S, *et al.*: Energy-efficient multilevel heterogeneous routing protocol for wireless sensor networks. *IEEE Access.* 2019; **7**: 55873–55884.
- [31] Huang H, Yin H, Min G, *et al.*: Energy-Aware Dual-Path Geographic Routing to Bypass Routing Holes in Wireless Sensor Networks. *IEEE Trans. Mob. Comput.* Jun. 2018; **17**(6): 1339–1352.
- [32] Wang K, Yu CM, Wang LC: DORA: A Destination-Oriented Routing Algorithm for Energy-Balanced Wireless Sensor Networks. *IEEE Internet Things J.* Feb. 2021; **8**(3): 2080–2081
- [33] Jain S, Pattanaik KK, Verma RK, *et al.*: Delay-Aware Green Routing for Mobile-Sink-Based Wireless Sensor Networks. *IEEE Internet Things J.* Mar. 2021; **8**(6): 4882–4892.
- [34] Xu Y, Jiao W, Tian M: An Energy-Efficient Routing Protocol for 3D Wireless Sensor Networks. *IEEE Sensors J.* Sep. 2021; **21**(17): 19550–19559.
- [35] Zhao Z, Shi D, Hui G, *et al.*: An Energy-Optimization Clustering Routing Protocol Based on Dynamic Hierarchical Clustering in 3D WSNs. *IEEE Access.* 2019; **7**: 80159–80173.
- [36] Jaradat Y, Masoud M, Jannoud I: A Mathematical Framework of Optimal Number of Clusters in 3D Noise-Prone WSN Environment. *IEEE Sens. J.* Mar. 2019; **19**(6): 2378–2388.
- [37] Chen C, Wang LC, Yu CM: D2CRP: A Novel Distributed 2-Hop Cluster Routing Protocol for Wireless Sensor Networks. *IEEE Internet Things J.* Oct. 2022.
- [38] Heinzelman WR, Chandrakasan A, Balakrishnan H: Energy-efficient communication protocol for wireless microsensor networks. *Proceedings of the Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences*. IEEE; 2000; p. 223.

- [39] Behera TM, Mohapatra SK, Samal UC, *et al.*: Residual energy-based cluster-head selection in WSNs for IoT application. *IEEE Internet Things J.* Jun. 2019; 6(3): 5132–5139.
- [40] Sert SA, Alchihabi A, Yazici A: A Two-Tier Distributed Fuzzy Logic Based Protocol for Efficient Data Aggregation in Multihop Wireless Sensor Networks. *IEEE Trans. Fuzzy Syst.* Dec. 2018; 26(6): 3615–3629.
- [41] Adil M, Khan R, Ali J, *et al.*: An energy proficient load balancing routing scheme for wireless sensor networks to maximize their lifespan in an operational environment. *IEEE Access.* 2020; 8: 163209–163224.
- [42] Liu Y, Liu A, Zhang N, *et al.*: DDC: Dynamic duty cycle for improving delay and energy efficiency in wireless sensor networks. *J. Netw. Comput. Appl.* Apr. 2019; 131: 16–27.
- [43] Wang Z, Ding H, Li B, *et al.*: An Energy Efficient Routing Protocol Based on Improved Artificial Bee Colony Algorithm for Wireless Sensor Networks. *IEEE Access.* 2020; 8: 133577–133596.
- [44] Kaur T, Kumar D: Particle Swarm Optimization-Based Unequal and Fault Tolerant Clustering Protocol for Wireless Sensor Networks. *IEEE Sens. J.* Jun. 2018; 18(11): 4614–4622.
- [45] Quoc DN, Liu N, Guo D: A hybrid fault-tolerant routing based on Gaussian network for wireless sensor network. *J. Commun. Netw.* Sep. 2021; 24(1): 37–46.
- [46] Shetty BS, Suresha: Survey on Energy Efficient Routing Protocols by Clustering and Load balancing in Wireless Sensor Networks. 2018.
- [47] Guleria K, Verma AK: Comprehensive review for energy efficient hierarchical routing protocols on wireless sensor networks. *Wirel. Netw.* Apr. 15, 2019; 25(3): 1159–1183. Springer New York LLC.
- [48] Habib MA, Moh S: Game theory-based Routing for wireless sensor networks: A comparative survey. *Applied Sciences (Switzerland)*. Jul. 01, 2019; 9(14). MDPI AG.
- [49] Al-Mekhlafi ZG, Hanapi ZM, Saleh AMS: Firefly-inspired time synchronization mechanism for self-organizing energy-efficient wireless sensor networks: A survey. *IEEE Access.* 2019; 7: 115229–115248.
- [50] Lin D, Wang Q, Min W, *et al.*: A Survey on Energy-Efficient Strategies in Static Wireless Sensor Networks. *ACM Trans. Sens. Netw.* Nov. 2020; 17(1): 1–48.
- [51] Nakas C, Kandris D, Visvardis G: Energy efficient routing in wireless sensor networks: A comprehensive survey. *Algorithms*. Mar. 01, 2020; 13(3). MDPI AG.
- [52] Chan L, Gomez Chavez K, Rudolph H, *et al.*: Hierarchical routing protocols for wireless sensor network: a compressive survey. *Wirel. Netw.* Jul. 2020; 26(5): 3291–3314.
- [53] Ullah Z: A Survey on Hybrid, Energy Efficient and Distributed (HEED) Based Energy Efficient Clustering Protocols for Wireless Sensor Networks. *Wirel. Pers. Commun.* Jun. 01, 2020; 112(4): 2685–2713. Springer.
- [54] Chowdhury SM, Hossain A: Different Energy Saving Schemes in Wireless Sensor Networks: A Survey. *Wirel. Pers. Commun.* Oct. 01, 2020; 114(3): 2043–2062. Springer.
- [55] Kandris D, Nakas C, Vomvas D, *et al.*: Applications of wireless sensor networks: An up-to-date survey. *Appl. Syst. Innov.* Mar. 01, 2020; 3(1): 1–24. MDPI AG.